

Appendix D Descriptive characteristics and main results of studies included in the systematic review

Authors, Publication year	Type of Article Manuscript, Unpublished Thesis, Conference Paper, Working Paper Language English Turkish	Sector Type: Public Private Sector Education Health Banking Hospitality Textile Other	N=Sample Size F: Female M: Male	Educational Status PS: Primary school, HS: High school, G: Graduate, PG: Postgraduate PhD.: Doctorate	Chronbach's Alpha Reliability Coefficient ODS Total (Sub-scale Cronbach's Alpha values were taken for studies that did not give ODS Total Cronbach's Alpha) PC: Participate-Criticism T: Transparency, J: Justice, E: Equality, A: Accountability	Variables searched to be Related to Organizational Democracy	Main Results
1. Kesen, 2015a.	Paper/ English	Private/ Retail Sector	N=142 F:62 M: 80	PS: 9 HS: 80 G: 53	.954	-Organizational identification - Job satisfaction	- A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS subscales and Organizational Identification (r=.304-.433). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales and Job Satisfaction (r=.237-495).
2. Kesen, 2015b.	Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Retail Sector	N=174 F:85 M: 89	PS: 11 HS: 95 G: 68	.954	- Employee performance - Organizational identification	- A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS subscales and Employee Performance (r=.272-.362). - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS subscales and Organizational identification (r=.375-482).
3. Geçkil, İleri, Kaya and Karadağ, 2016.	Paper/ English	Public and Private/ Hospital Employees (Physician and Nurse)	N=363 F:232 M:131	HS: 73 G: 191 PG: 99	.933	- Psychological capital - Demographics (profession, age, educational status, gender, marital status, experience in hospital)	- A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and psychological capital (r=.126). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales and psychological capital (r=.015-.174). Demographics - A significant relationship was found between ODS total and profession against nurses (t=-2.589; p=.010) - A significant correlation was found between ODS total scores and age (F=-2.912; p=.034). ODS scores of individuals under the age of 40 are lower than those of those over the age of 40. - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between ODS scores and education, marital status, and working time (p>.05).
4. Geckil and Tikici, 2016.	Paper/ English	Public/ Hospital Employees (Physician, Nurse, Laborant and officer)	N=582 F=351 M=231	HS: 61 G: 319 PG: 202	.940	- Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) - Demographics (Gender, age, educational status, profession, experience in hospital.)	- A significant and negative correlation was found between ODS total and subscales and OCB Altruism subscale (r= -.118 to -.193). - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and subscales and OCB Conscientiousness subscale (r=.379-.682). - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and subscales and OCB Courtesy subscale (r= .470-.786). - There was no significant correlation between ODS total and subscales of OCB's Sportsmanship subscale (p>.05). - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and subscales and OCB Civic Virtue subscale (r= .531-.892).

							Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant correlation was found between ODS total and gender in favor of males ($t=-3.920$; $p=.000$) - A significant relationship was found between ODS total and profession against nurses ($F=-3.132$; $p=.025$) - A significant correlation was found between total ODS and working time ($F=-8.683$; $p=.000$). ODS scores of those working for less than 1 year were found to be significantly higher than the others. - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between the participants' ODS scores and their education and age ($p>.05$).
5.Bakan, Güler and Kara, 2017.	Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Hospitality Industry	N=201 F:88 M: 113	PS: 5 HS: 24 G: 172	PC: .809 T: .793 J: .750 E: .689 A: .679	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational justice - Perceived organizational support 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS subscales and organizational justice subscales ($r=.478-.769$). - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS subscales and organizational support ($r=.365-.714$).
6.Geçkil, Akpınar and Taş, 2017.	Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Hospital Employees (Physician, Nurse, Lab orant and officer)	N= 405 F:268 M: 137	Unknown	.944	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Job satisfaction - Demographics (profession, age, educational status, gender, marital status, experience in hospital, income) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total scores and job satisfaction total ($r=.622$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscale scores and job satisfaction subscales ($r=.391-.559$). Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant correlation was found between ODS total score and gender in favor of males ($t=-2.929$; $p=.004$). - A significant relationship was found between ODS total score and profession against nurses ($F=-10.235$; $p=.000$) - A significant relationship was found between ODS total score and working time ($F=-3.037$; $p=.029$). ODS total scores of those who have worked for less than 5 years are higher than the others. - A significant correlation was found between the total ODS and age ($F=-3.106$; $p=.046$). ODS scores of individuals under the age of 40 are lower than those of those over the age of 41.
7.Geçkil and Koçyiğit, 2017.	Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Hospitality Industry	N=144 F: 41 M: 102 Unknown: 1	PS: 34 HS: 60 G: 42 PG: 5 Unknown: 3	.950	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Psychological capital 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and psychological capital total scores ($r=.338$). - There was no significant correlation between ODS total and subscales and psychological capital optimism subscale scores ($p>.05$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and psychological capital resilience subscale scores ($r=.389-.561$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and psychological capital hope subscale scores ($r=.227-.301$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and psychological capital self-efficacy subscale scores ($r=.196-.270$).
8.Işık, 2017.	Paper/ Turkish	Public/ İŞKUR	N=32 F: 14 M: 18	HS: 2 G: 18 PG: 12	.866	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, job positions/profession, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant positive correlation was found between the age of the participants and the ODS accountability subscale ($r=.506$; $p=.003$) and equality subscale scores ($r=.401$; $p=.023$). As age increases, scores increase.

		(an employe nt agency)				income, and job tenure).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A negative significant correlation ($r = -.468$; $p = .007$) was found between the education level of the participants and the accountability subscale scores of the ODS. - A positive and significant correlation ($r = .607$; $p = .000$) was found between the participants' working time and the accountability subscale scores of the ODS.
9. Işıkgöz, Esentaş and Dinçer, 2017.	Paper/ English	Public/ Education Sector	N= 191 F: 72 M: 119	G: 161 PG: 30	.910	- Demographics (gender, marital status, educational status, school type)	Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There was no significant relationship between ODS subscales scores and gender, school type, marital status, educational status ($p > .05$). - Significant relationships were found between ODS transparency, justice, and accountability subscales scores, and assigned geographical region ($p < .05$). - A significant correlation was found between ODS equality subscale scores and duration of the experience (Chi-square: 11.319(df:5); $p = .045$). The equality subscale score of employees between 1-5 years is higher than those with 21-25 years of experience.
10. Öge and Çiftçi, 2017.	Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Automotive Textile	N= 77 F: 52 M: 24 Unknown: 1	PS: 36 HS: 30 G: 8 PG: 1 Unknown: 2	No Information	- Intrapreneurship tendency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and intrapreneurship tendency total scores ($r = .668$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and intrapreneurship tendency innovation subscale scores ($r = .267-.521$). No significant relationship was found with the ODS justice subscale. - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and intrapreneurship tendency risk-taking and proactivity subscale scores ($r = .268-.663$). ODS equality subscale did not show a significant correlation. - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and intrapreneurship tendency autonomy subscale scores ($r = .291-.471$). ODS did not show any significant correlation with equity and justice subscales.
11. Atalay, 2018.	Paper/ English	Public/ The Provincial Directorate s of Youth Services and Sports	N= 920 F: 322 M: 598	PS: 16 HS: 112 G: 757 PG: 24 PhD.: 11	.787	- Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, profession and geographical region).	Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant relationship was found between ODS total, ODS justice, and accountability subscales scores and the education levels of the participants ($p < .05$). Participants with Ph.D. education levels had significantly higher ODS total, justice, and accountability subscale scores ($p < .05$). - A significant relationship was found between the ODS transparency subscale and occupation. Coaches' transparency subscale scores were found to be significantly higher ($p < .05$). - Some significant relationships were found between ODS total and subscale scores according to geographical region ($p < .05$).
12. Aykanat and Yıldız, 2018.	Conference Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Municipality	N= 120 F: Unknown M: Unknown	Unknown	PC: .810 T: .880 J: .810 E: .660 A: .850	- Social capital	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales and social capital structural ($r = .556-.645$), relational ($r = .303-.591$) and cognitive ($r = .460-.688$) subscale scores.
13. Çankaya, 2018.	Paper/	Public/	N= 200 F: 76	HS: 84 G: 84	PC: .875	- Job satisfaction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales job satisfaction total scores ($r = .449-.563$).

	Turkish	Hospital Employees (Physician, Nurse, Laborant and officer)	M:124	PG: 32	T: .924 J: .878 E: .754 A: .794	- Demographics (profession, age, educational status, gender, marital status, experience in hospital, income)	- Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales and job satisfaction intrinsic satisfaction subscale scores ($r = .411-.498$). - Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS subscales and job satisfaction extrinsic satisfaction subscale scores ($r = .457-.602$). Demographics - A significant correlation was found between the participants' ODS total scores and gender in favor of males ($t = -3.332$; $p = .001$). - A significant correlation was found between the participants' ODS total scores and their marital status in favor of singles ($t = -3.837$; $p = .000$). - A significant correlation was found between ODS total and age ($F = -10.259$; $p = .000$). ODS scores of individuals under the age of 30 are lower than those of those aged 31-40. - A significant relationship was found between the total ODS and educational status ($F = -10.259$; $p = .000$). The ODS score of those whose education level is High School is lower than vocational school. - A significant relationship was found between the total ODS and experience in the hospital ($F = -5.377$; $p = .000$). Participants with less than 5 years of experience have a lower ODS total score than those with 11-15 years of experience.
14. Karagöz and Atilla, 2018.	Paper/ Turkish	Public and Private/ Banking Sector	N=142 F:72 M: 70	G: 131 PG: 11	.943	- Psychological capital	- A significant positive correlation was found between ODS total and psychological capital total scores ($r = .391$; $p = .000$).
15. Tokay and Eyüpoglu, 2018.	Paper/ English	Private/ Banking Sector	N=240 F:116 M:124	HS: 25 G: 128 PG: 87	.790	- Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) - Demographics (Gender, age, educational status, marital status, experience in banking sector)	- Significant and positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and organizational citizenship behaviors total scores ($r = .201-.404$). Demographics - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between the participants' ODS scores and gender, age, education in status, marital status, and experience in the banking sector ($p > .05$).
16. Bakan and Gözükar, 2019.	Conference Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Municipality	N=181 F: 42 M: 138	HS: 41 G: 114 PG: 14 Unknown: 11	PC: .914 T: .900 J: .866 E: .788 A: .835	- Organizational depression	- Significant and negative correlations were found between ODS subscales and organizational depression scores ($r = -.601$ to $-.714$).
17. Barutçu, 2019.	Master Thesis/ Turkish	Private/ Banking Sector	N=120 F: 58 M: 62	G: 84 PG: 36	PC: .805 T: .718 J: .712 E: .725 A: .786	- Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) - Demographics (age, gender, marital status,	- ODS subscale scores explain 74.1% of the change in OCB (Adjusted $R^2 = .741$; $p = .000$). - ODS transparency ($\beta = .074$; $p = .030$), justice ($\beta = .454$; $p = .000$), equality ($\beta = .501$; $p = .000$), and accountability ($\beta = .105$; $p = .008$)

						educational status, profession/position, and experience in job).	<p>subscale scores significantly and positively affect OCB scores ($p<.05$).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There was no significant correlation between ODS participation-criticism subscale and OCB scores ($p>.05$). <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There was no significant relationship between ODS scores and participants' gender, age, education level, marital status, job position, and duration of the experience ($p>.05$).
18. Günden, 2019.	PhD Thesis/ Turkish	Private/ Hospitality Industry	N=367 F: 194 M: 173	HS: 44 G: 318 PG: 5	.865	- Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB)	- As a result of the path diagram between ODS and OCB, a significant positive relationship was found. In standardized path coefficients, it was observed that a one-unit increase in ODS resulted in a .40-unit increase in OCB ($r=.40$; $p<.05$).
19. Karatepe, 2019.	PhD Thesis/ Turkish	Public and Private/ Hospital Nurses	N=300 F: 207 M: 93	HS: 113 G: 180 PG: 7	.930	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Political sensitivity - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, hospital type public or private, income and experience in job). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Significant positive correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and political sensitivity total ($r=.172-.266$), knowledge ($r=.187-.317$), cognition ($r=.130-.199$), participation ($r=.119-.202$) and, subscales of interest ($r=.136-.195$). - No significant correlation was found between the ODS Justice subscale and political sensitivity cognition subscale scores ($p>0.05$). <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Men's ODS justice subscale scores were found to be significantly higher than women's scores ($t=-1.93$ $p=.04$). - Singles had significantly higher ODS total ($t=3.70$; $p=.00$) and all subscale scores ($p<.05$). - ODS equality subscale scores of vocational school graduates were found to be significantly higher than graduate graduates ($F=4.10$; $p=.00$). - It was determined that the ODS total ($t=8.12$; $p=.00$) and all subscale scores of the participants working in private hospitals were significantly higher than the scores of those working in public hospitals ($p<.05$). - It was found that as the working time of the participants increased, their justice scores decreased significantly ($r=-.132$; $p<.05$). - A significant negative correlation was found between the income level of the participants and the ODS total ($r=-.358$; $p<.01$) and all subscale scores ($p<.05$).
20. Naldöken and Limoncu, (2019).	Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Hospital Employees (Physician, Nurse, Laborant and officer)	N= 326 F:170 M:156	PS: 16 HS: 75 G: 194 PG: 41	.929	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational commitment - Demographics (gender, age, marital status, educational status, profession and job tenure) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and organizational commitment total scores ($r=.302-.446$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and organizational commitment affective commitment subscale scores ($r=.270-.368$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS total and organizational commitment continuance commitment subscale ($r=.016$). There is no significant relationship between ODS and its subscales and organizational commitment continuance commitment subscale ($p>.05$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and organizational commitment normative commitment subscale ($r=.352-.489$).

							<p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was found that there was no significant relationship between ODS scores, gender, and duration of the experience ($p>.05$). - Singles had significantly higher ODS total and subscale scores ($p<.05$).
21. Uysal, 2019.	Master Thesis/ Turkish	Public/ Sea Transportat ion Sector	N=316 F: 18 M: 298	PS: 54 HS: 147 G: 114 PG: 1	.922	- Organizational commitment	- A significant relationship was found between ODS total and organizational commitment total scores ($p<.05$).
22. Yalçınkaya, 2019.	Master Thesis/ Turkish	Private/ Communication Sector	N=397 F: 254 M: 143	HS: 140 G: 222 PG: 35	PC: .821 T: .741 J: .782 E: .711 A: .724	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational commitment - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, and experience in job). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A positive and significant relationship was found between the ODS equality subscale and the organizational commitment affective commitment subscale ($\beta=.225$; $p:.015$). - There was no significant relationship between ODS subscales and continuance commitment subscale ($p>.05$). - A negative and significant relationship was found between ODS participation-criticism and organizational commitment normative commitment subscale ($\beta= -.376$; $p:.000$). - A positive and significant relationship was found between ODS transparency and organizational commitment normative commitment subscale ($\beta=-.482$; $p:.000$). <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Men's ODS justice subscale scores were found to be significantly higher than women's scores ($t=2.361$ $p=.000$). - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between ODS scores and participants' age, education level, marital status, and duration of the experience ($p>.05$).
23. Bilyay, Yalçın and Özpolat, 2020.	Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Education Sector	N=202 F:135 M: 67	G and PG: 202	.700	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational dissent - Demographics (gender, type of school and total employment duration in profession) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant and positive correlation was found between ODS total and organizational dissent total ($r=.220$), upward dissent subscale ($r=.48$) scores. - No significant correlation was found between ODS and lateral dissent and displaced dissent subscales ($p>.05$). - It was found that the upward dissent subscale explained 14.8% of the variance in the ODS (Adjusted $R^2=.148$; $p=.001$). <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was found that there was no significant relationship between OD and participants' gender and working time ($p>.05$).
24. Erdal, 2020.	Master Thesis/ Turkish	Public/ Educationa l Sector Teacher	N=345 F: 238 M: 107	G: 345	.767	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational dissent - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, and experience in job). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A positive and significant correlation was found between ODS and organizational dissent ($r=.647$). <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between ODS and gender, marital status, age, and professional seniority.
25. Erkasap, 2020.	PhD Thesis/ Turkish	Private/ Various Sector	N=509 F: 352 M: 157	HS: 29 G: 202 PG: 235 PhD: 43	.939	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Personality characteristics - Organizational silence - Organizational dissent 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - One unit increase in ODS total leads to a .304 increase in organizational dissent total ($\beta=.304$; $p=.003$). - ODS transparency subscale has a positive effect on upward dissent subscale ($\beta=.464$; $p=.001$). On the other hand, justice ($\beta= -.451$;

							<p>p=.001) and accountability ($\beta = -.304$; p=.001) subscales have a negative impact on organizational dissent.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ODS transparency ($\beta = -.286$; p=.001) and equality ($\beta = -.205$; p=.001) subscales negatively affect lateral dissent subscale. On the other hand, the participation-criticism subscale positively affects lateral dissent ($\beta = .336$; p=.001). - One unit increase in ODS leads to a .309 unit decrease in organizational silence ($\beta = -.309$; p=.004). - The participation-criticism ($\beta = -.274$; p=.001) transparency ($\beta = -.310$; p=.001) and justice ($\beta = -.134$; p=.023) subscales of the ODS were acquiescent silence subscales negatively affects the scale. - ODS equality ($\beta = -.162$; p=.004) and justice ($\beta = -.305$; p=.001) subscales negatively affect the defensive silence subscale. - ODS accountability subscale positively affects prosocial silence subscale ($\beta = .151$; p=.001). - Personality characteristic adaptive peace maker ($\beta = .288$; p=.005), strict perfectionist ($\beta = .323$; p=.001), quiet specialist ($\beta = .189$; p=.037), and loyal sceptic subscales ($\beta = .280$; p=.007) affect ODS significantly and positively.
26. Erkasap and Ülgen, 2020.	Working Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Various Sector	N= 225 F: 161 M: 64	HS: 13 G: 89 PG: 123	PC: 938 T: .917 J: .889 E: .916 A: .815	- Organizational dissent	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ODS transparency subscale ($\beta = .286$; p=.001) on total organizational dissent was positive; justice ($\beta = -.251$; p=.001), equality ($\beta = -.150$; p=.020) and accountability ($\beta = -.228$; p=.001) subscales had a negative and significant effect has been determined. ODS participation-criticism subscale did not affect the total organizational dissent (p<.05). - On vertical organizational dissent, the ODS transparency subscale ($\beta = .459$; p=.001) was in the positive direction; justice ($\beta = -.445$; p=.001) and accountability subscales ($\beta = -.331$; p=.001) were found to have a negative and significant effect. No significant correlation was found between ODS participation-criticism and equality subscales and upward organizational dissent (p>.05). - On organizational dissent, ODS transparency ($\beta = -.192$; p=.001) and equality ($\beta = -.262$; p=.001) subscales were found to be negative; the participation-criticism subscale ($\beta = .267$; p=.001) was found to have a positive and significant effect. It was determined that ODS justice and accountability subscales did not have a significant effect on organizational lateral dissent (p>.05).
27. Kara, 2020.	Master Thesis/ Turkish	Private/ Industrial Enterprise	N=300 F: 54 M: 246	PS and HS: 192 G: 89 PG: 19	.940	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Intention to quit from job - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, income, and experience in job). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A negative and significant correlation was found between ODS total (r=-.418), participation-criticism (r=-.389), transparency (r=-.417), justice (r=-.476), and equality (r=-.165) subscales and intention to quit the job. There was no significant relationship between ODS Accountability subscale and the intention to quit from the job. <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Men's ODS participation-criticism (t=-5.548; p=.000) and accountability (t=-4.027; p=.001) subscale scores were found to be significantly higher than women's scores. - As the age of the participants increases, the ODS participation-criticism (F=33.509; p=.000), transparency (F=40.522; p=.000), and justice (F=30.638; p=.000) subscale scores increase significantly.

							<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Participants between the ages of 30-39 had significantly higher ODS scores of equality ($F=24.033$; $p=.000$) and accountability ($F=12.202$; $p=.000$) subscales. - Participants with high school or lower education levels had higher ODS participation-criticism ($t=6.000$; $p=.003$) and transparency ($t=5.435$; $p=.016$) subscale scores compared to the scores of participants with higher education levels. - Married participants had significantly higher ODS scores on all subscales ($t=-.999$ to -6.277; $p<.05$). - ODS participation-criticism ($F=69.439$; $p=.000$), transparency ($F=122.601$; $p=.000$), justice ($F=97.823$; $p=.000$), and equality of participants with work experience of 11 years or more ($F=14.406$; $p=.000$) subscale scores were significantly higher than the scores of those with shorter experience.
28. Karadağ and Geçkil, 2020.	Paper/ Turkish	Public/ Higher Education Sector	N=192 F:87 M: 102 Unknown: 3	PG: 192	.960	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational silence - Demographics (gender and title) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and organizational silence total scores ($r=-.159$ to $-.258$). - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and acquiescent silence subscale scores ($r=-.156$ to $-.218$). There is no relationship between the ODS justice subscale and acquiescent silence. - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and defensive silence subscale scores ($r=-.184$ to $-.293$). - A positive and significant correlation was found between the ODS participation criticism subscale and the prosocial (protective) silence subscale ($r=.149$). There is no significant relationship between ODS total and other subscales and protective silence subscale. <p>Demographics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Women's ODS total ($t=2.288$; $p=.023$), transparency ($t=2.365$; $p=.019$), justice ($t=2.696$; $p=.008$) and accountability subscales ($t=3.082$; $p=.002$) scores were found to be significantly higher than that of men. No significant correlation was found between ODS participation-criticism and equality subscale and gender ($p>.05$).
29. Pelenk, 2020.	Paper/ Turkish	Private/ Construction Sector	N=380 F: 95 M: 285	Unknown	.910	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational culture - Organizational dissent 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS justice and transparency subscales and clan culture subscale ($r=-.105$ to $-.120$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between the ODS participation criticism subscale and the adhocracy culture subscale ($r=.103$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and market culture subscale ($r=.166$-.283). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS participation, criticism, equality, and accountability subscales and hierarchy subscale ($r=.175$-.275). - There was no significant relationship between ODS subscales and upward dissent subscale ($p>.05$).

							<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Positive and significant correlations were found between the ODS participation criticism, transparency, and justice subscales and the lateral dissent subscale ($r=.216-.263$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between the ODS participation criticism, transparency, and justice subscales and the displaced dissent subscale ($r=.229-.281$).
30.Üst Can, 2020.	PhD Thesis/ Turkish	Public and Private/ Higher Educationa l Sector	N=281 F: 103 M: 174	G: 13 PG: 59 PhD: 205	.957	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, university type and experience in job). 	Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was determined that there was no significant relationship between ODS and gender, marital status, and professional seniority. - Negative significant correlations were found between ODS accountability subscale scores and age ($r=-.137$), and education ($r=-.121$) level ($p<.05$).
31. Yıldırım and Deniz, 2020.	Paper/ Turkish	Private	N= 252 F: Unknown M. Unknown	PS and HS: 29 G and PG: 223	.943	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Work engagement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A one-unit increase in ODS total score causes an increase of 0.407 in work engagement ($\beta= .407$). - The increase in ODS participation-criticism subscale scores leads to a significant decrease in work engagement vigor, dedication, and absorption subscale scores ($\beta= -.205$ to $-.343$). - The increase in ODS transparency subscale scores leads to a significant increase in work engagement perseverance, dedication and adoption subscale scores ($\beta= .746-.867$). - The increase in ODS justice subscale scores leads to a significant decrease in work engagement perseverance, dedication and adoption subscale scores ($\beta= -.215$ to $-.402$). - The increase in ODS accountability subscale scores leads to a significant decrease in work engagement perseverance and dedication subscale scores ($\beta= -.073$ to $-.075$).
32.Çavuş and Biçer, 2021.	Paper/ English	Private/ Various Sector	N=257 F: 105 M: 152	HS: 70 G: 120 PG: 57	.845	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Organizational citizenship behaviors (OCB) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and OCB altruism subscale ($r=.357-.431$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and OCB conscientiousness subscale ($r=.435-.496$). - There were positive and significant correlations between ODS subscales and OCB courtesy subscale ($r=.414-.487$). - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and OCB civic virtue subscale ($r=.614-.676$). - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and OCB sportsmanship subscale ($r=-.390$ to $-.468$).
33. Geçkil and Şendoğdu, 2021.	Paper/ English	Public and Private/ Banking Sector	N=397 F: 171 M: 226	HS: 15 G: 323 PG: 59	.960	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Quality of work life - Demographics (age, gender, marital status, educational status, bank type, job positions/profession, income, and working time in business). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Positive and significant correlations were found between ODS total and subscales and quality of work-life total ($r=.545-.801$). - ODS total and subscales, job and carrier satisfaction ($r=.451-.676$), general well-being ($r=.509-.716$), control at work ($r=.410-.697$), working conditions ($r=.527-.745$), stress at work ($r=.359-.521$), and home-work interface ($r=.459-.735$) subscales were found to have positive and significant correlations. Demographics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It was found that there was no significant relationship between ODS and gender and educational status ($p>.05$). - A significant correlation was found between ODS and marital status in favor of singles ($t=-2.30$; $p=.022$).

							<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A significant correlation was found between ODS and age groups ($F=5.400$; $p=.000$). The ODS score of the under-31 age group is higher than those aged 32-37. - The ODS scores of those with a working period of 5 years or less were found to be significantly higher than those with a 6-11 year working period ($F=4.893$; $p=.002$).
34. Tokgöz and Önen, 2021.	Paper/ English	Public/ Educationa l Sector	N=622 F: 350 M: 272	Unknown	.940	- Job stress level	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Negative and significant correlations were found between ODS subscales and job stress total ($r=-.110$ to $-.230$). There was no significant relationship between the ODS accountability subscale and job stress ($p>.05$).